

Jointly Held  
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees  
Meeting Minutes

January 19, 2021

**Members Present**

**Via Teleconference:** John Lumpkin, Jointly Held Committees Chair  
Vince Corrado (arrived at 8:57 a.m.)  
Sharon Hairston  
Adrienne Heard  
Sharon Howard (departed at approximately 10:00 a.m.)  
Belinda Matthews-Stenson  
Thomas Weckesser  
David P. Williamson

**Staff in Attendance:**

Mark Donaghy  
Daron Brown  
Chris Cole  
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall Co., L.P.A. (via teleconference)  
Tim Harrington  
Deborah Howard  
Brandon Policicchio  
Bob Ruzinsky  
Mary K. Stanforth

**Others Attending:**

Various citizens via teleconference

Mr. Lumpkin called the meeting to order at 8:35 a.m. and roll call was taken:

**Roll Call**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Excused
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

**Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority**

4 S. Main Street Dayton, OH 45402 • 937-425-8400 P • 937-425-8416 F • [www.iriderta.org](http://www.iriderta.org)

**Approval of December 15, 2020 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes**

Mr. Lumpkin asked if attendees request a reading of the December 15, 2020 meeting minutes or have any corrections to the minutes.

Upon hearing no requests or corrections, Mr. Lumpkin DECLARED ACCEPTANCE of the December 15, 2020 jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting minutes.

**February Board Action Items:**

With regard to all Action Items presented today, each Item is essential to the delivery of transportation services to the public.

**Action Item #2 – Hydro Excavation Services**

Mr. Brown explained the purpose of this procurement is for the Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority (RTA) to contract with a qualified vendor for Hydro Excavation Services. The contractor will be required to hydro excavate pole foundations that cannot be prepared using standard foundation excavation. This technique is utilized to avoid destroying underground items such as water lines and electrical systems.

This project and process are in accordance with our core value of Stewardship, by improving and maintaining our infrastructure and using procedures to keep any disruption or damage to underground utilities and the surrounding areas to a minimum as we maintain our commitment to the community, environment, and customers.

The successful vendor will hydro excavate an estimated total of 300 foundations over the term of the five (5) year contract based on projects coming up and pole strikes, which occur when poles are struck and damaged by vehicles. The vendor shall furnish the labor, water, and vacuum truck and will be responsible for any permits required by the City of Dayton and Montgomery County, disposal of all debris, and the cost for disposing of the debris.

For the term of the five (5) year contract, it is estimated that 60 foundations per year will be completed for a total of 300. Each foundation requires approximately three hours to complete for an estimated 180 hours per year. The rate for years one (1) and two (2) is \$220 per hour or \$39,600 per year. The rate for the last three (3) years is \$230 per hour or \$41,400 per year. The five (5) years estimated total is \$203,400 plus a 15% contingency of \$30,510 to cover unknown items that may come up for a total of \$233,910.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a five (5) year CONTRACT AWARD to Badger Daylighting for Hydro Excavation Services for \$203,400 plus a 15% contingency of \$30,510 for an estimated total of \$233,910. This procurement will be funded with operating funds.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Excused
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 7-0.

**Action Item #3 – Architectural / Engineering Professional Services**

Mr. Ruzinsky stated the purpose of this procurement is to contract with qualified architectural and engineering firm(s) to provide RTA with professionals to lead various capital projects included in the budget. RTA anticipated awarding a five (5) year contract(s) with two (2) one-year options. This project is consistent with RTA’s core value of Stewardship as our commitment to managing our time, talent, and resources efficiently, and responsibly.

A qualification based procurement method was used where evaluation criteria other than price was used to determine the most qualified firms(s). After the top firms were selected by the evaluation team, pricing was requested.

When RTA identifies a project, the firm under contract will be requested to submit a proposal for said project at the contracted hourly rates. RTA will retain the right not to use the firms under contract if an agreement on the proposal cannot be reached.

The committee evaluated the proposals based on the following criteria:

- Approach to providing the requested Scope of Work.  
Proposal should demonstrate an understanding of the RFP and the Scope of Work.
- Management and team’s qualifications and previous experience with similar projects.  
Include any specific skills, relevant affiliations, certifications, and recent experience conducting work of similar scope.
- Financial and technical capability of the proposers.  
Must have adequate financial resources and the ability to acquire technical resources.
- References.  
References from last five (5) contracts.
- Quality of proposal preparation and presentation, if applicable.  
Proposal should have numbered pages and a Table of Contents.

The following firms submitted proposals:

<b>Firm</b>	<b>Location</b>
Alan Scherr Associates, LLC	Kettering, OH
APP Architecture	Englewood, OH
Barge Design Solutions	Dayton, OH
Champlin Architecture	Dayton, OH
EC Purdy & Associates	Chicago, IL
Helmig Lienesch LLC	Dayton, OH
Levin Porter Architects	Miamisburg, OH
LWC Incorporation	Dayton, OH
Matrix Architects	Dayton, OH
Norton Engineering, LLC	Dayton, OH
Oregon Group Architects	Dayton, OH
Pinnacle Architects	Miamisburg, OH
Public Health & Safety, Inc.	Chicago, IL
Richard L. Bowen + Associates	Cleveland, OH
Tri-Tech	Centerville, OH

Following the evaluation and presentations, the evaluation committee decided to recommend awards to two (2) architectural/engineering firms to manage projects such as facility renovations, historic architectural services, etc., and an engineering firm to handle matters such as infrastructure improvements, structural issues, etc.

After evaluating the proposals, the firms listed below were considered the top firms, were shortlisted, and pricing was requested. The other firms were not given further consideration because agreements were successfully negotiated with the top firms in accordance with the method of procurement.

<b>Firm</b>	<b>Area of Expertise</b>
Alan Scherr Associates, LLC	Architecture/Engineering
Barge Design Solutions	Engineering
Champlin Architecture	Architecture/Engineering

Architecture/Engineering is typically budgeted at 10%, depending on the complexity of construction projects in the capital budget approved by the Board of Trustees as part of the annual budget process. On an annual basis, these projects will be included in the budget. Not all capital construction projects will require architecture/engineering services.

While each firm will have an area of emphasis and expertise, RTA may have all firms work in different areas when determined to be in RTA's best interest. RTA will retain the right not to use firms under contract if an agreement on a specific project proposal cannot be reached, or it is determined that assistance is needed in an area these firms cannot provide.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Hairston that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees

CONTRACT AWARDS to Alan Scherr Associates, LLC and Champlin Architecture with an emphasis on architecture and engineering and to Barge Design Solutions with an emphasis on engineering for the hourly rates proposed for five (5) years and two (2) option years. The total dollar amounts will not exceed the annual budgeted amounts. This procurement will be partially funded with Federal Capital and Operating Funds.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Excused
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 7-0.

**Action Item #4 – Rescind Safety & Security Policy #1**

Ms. Stanforth explained Staff is updating the RTA’s “Employee Standards of Performance” (SOP) document to address a number of issues requiring change, with plans to publish the new document in the next 90 days. Portions of Safety & Security Policy #1 are incorporated in the SOP which can cause confusion, and additionally, Staff is moving the offense of using electronic devices while operating an RTA vehicle from a Group II violation to the Zero Tolerance category.

MOTION made by Ms. Matthews-Stenson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees RESCINDING Safety & Security Policy #1, effective on the date of implementation of the revised Employee Standards of Performance.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Excused
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 7-0.

**Action Item #5 – Connect On-Demand: Program Adoption & Expansion**

Mr. Policicchio explained that in 2017 RTA Board Trustees authorized Staff to enter into agreements with transportation providers to deliver a mobility partnership pilot program, called Connect On-Demand. The goal of On-Demand is to enhance and increase mobility access by

serving previously underserved and unserved communities. The program is designed and structured to complement, rather than compete with existing RTA services through a non-traditional service approach. On-Demand continues to ensure customers have access to quality, convenient and direct multi-modal mobility services.

As a result, RTA is recommending two (2) actions related to the program:

1. Formal adoption to accept the Connect On-Demand program as a regular RTA service offering; and
2. Expand an existing service zone and create a sixth zone. Maps of the changes were presented at today's meeting and attached as part of the meeting packet.

To date, over 100,000 trips have been provided, with the following outcomes of the program achieved to date:

- In previously underserved areas where bus route service was limited or unproductive, service is now 24/7 with direct access to jobs, educational institutions, grocery stores, and healthcare.
- Due to the program's low operating cost, RTA was able to redirect some of its fleet and operating funds to create better service on other routes and support the creation of The Flyer.
- On-Demand successfully complements RTA's existing service, with over 70% of trips connecting to and from bus routes, creating an effective first and last mile connection.

MOTION made by Ms. Howard and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Planning and Finance/Personnel Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees ADOPTION of the Connect On-Demand program as a regular RTA service offering, including the expansion and creation of services. Future Connect On-Demand budgets will be approved by the Board of Trustees as part of the annual budget process based on estimated need, thereby allowing for flexibility in annual amounts.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Excused
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 7-0.

Mr. Williamson commented that he is very pleased with the Connect On-Demand program and its success!

Mr. Corrado arrived at the meeting, via Zoom, at 8:57 a.m.

**Action Item #6 – Connect On-Demand**

Mr. Policicchio stated the RTA is seeking to enter into partnership agreements with qualified mobility providers to support the RTA Connect On-Demand program with a unified goal of enhancing and increasing mobility access within the region. The project is consistent with RTA’s Core Value of Quality Service as we recognize our customers as our highest priority.

On-Demand offers our customers more mobility options, increasing overall accessibility to the entire region, by increasing access to unserved and underserved areas. On-Demand complements our existing fixed route services, providing customers more choice in their travel planning.

Today, the Board is being asked to approve for a period of five (5) years at a cost of \$600,000 per year to be made available under the program.

The selected transportation providers will represent the RTA and must meet safety, performance and quality measures set by RTA.

The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine the most qualified proposers using the following criteria:

- Requirements outlined within the Scope of Work
- Reasonableness of Cost

The following providers submitted a proposal:

<b>Provider</b>
Anton’s Cab Service, LLC, Dayton, OH
Lyft, Inc., San Francisco, CA
Raiser, LLC (Uber), San Francisco, CA

The pricing received follows:

**Years 1 - 5**

	<b>Anton’s Cab Service<sup>1</sup></b>	<b>Lyft, Inc.<sup>2,3</sup></b>	<b>Raiser, LLC (Uber)<sup>2</sup></b>
<b>Trip Within Outlined Location</b>			
Base Fare		\$1.02	\$1.05
Minimum	\$9.00 for the first 3 miles	\$3.73	\$7.06
Per Mile	\$2.50	\$.93	\$.96
Per Minute	\$0	\$.18	\$.19

1 Fees fixed for a five-year period

2 Market Price: Fares may be higher due to an increase in demand

3 Service and applicable fees may apply such as toll roads, etc.

A price analysis was performed, and all provider fares were determined fair and reasonable.

MOTION made by Ms. Howard and SECONDED by Ms. Matthews-Stenson that the Planning and Finance/Personnel Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a CONTRACT AWARD to Anton’s Cab Service LLC, Raiser, LLC (Uber), and Lyft, Inc. for a total estimated award not to exceed \$600,000 per year, or \$3,000,000 for a five-year period. Funds will be divided as needed between the providers based upon customer choice of provider. In addition, the Chief Executive Officer is authorized to carry out all actions necessary to add additional qualified providers as needed throughout the duration of the contract period. Connect On-Demand providers will be paid with restricted local operating funds.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

**Customer and Business Development Update**

Mr. Policicchio provided a Customer and Business Development Department update including:

- Beginning February 1, 2021, RTA will offer a more cost-friendly payment experience with the introduction of fare capping via Tapp Pay. Fare capping literally caps the amount a person spends via an electronic tracking system when a customer has paid the equivalent of a day pass or monthly pass within a given timeframe. This will help customers who rely on public transportation from paying more because they can’t afford to pay the entire cost of a bus pass in a single transaction, allowing them to focus more on riding and less on affordability.
- In February, Ohio transit agencies will collectively advocate for public transit during Ohio Loves Transit week, February 7–14. This year, RTA will host a virtual campaign that will include sharing the importance of transit to our local communities on social media, and appreciation for customers who continued to rely on public transportation throughout the pandemic. Ohio Loves Transit is a statewide campaign presented by the Ohio Public Transit Association to inform the public of the vital role transit plays in their community!
- New Year, New Flyer! The Flyer has a new look in 2021! On January 4, RTA released its new 35-foot Flyer diesel bus. The new Flyer provides customers the ability to efficiently board and disembark from the front and rear of the bus, but is still smaller than the traditional 40-foot diesel, allowing it to be more nimble as it travels through downtown Dayton streets. The bus 2033 was the first new model to hit the road this year and is one of four new buses. The remaining buses are expected to be released in the very near future.



- As the pandemic persists, RTA continues to emphasize safety while using public transportation. New COVID-19 buses will be introduced to replace the current selection of public safety announcements, or PSAs, on buses that appeared during the latter half of 2020. These new ads will focus on vaccination. RTA further supported efforts by recreating multiple 15-second PSAs from the “Talking Buses” promotion. These ads were shared across all local TV stations through January 1<sup>st</sup>.

**Small Purchasing Information**

Ms. Howard stated the Small Purchasing Information was previously included in today’s meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

**New Business**

Mr. Williamson stated on January 28<sup>th</sup> the Dayton Business Journal will be hosting an online seminar on The Future of Our Cities. Mr. Williamson encouraged Committees Members and Staff to attend this informative and unique seminar.

Mr. Donaghy stated Ms. Cathy Garner will coordinate enrolling those who are interested in attending.

**Request for Executive Session**

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard to RECESS into Executive Session for the purpose of discussing a personnel matter.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

The meeting recessed into Executive Session at 9:05 a.m.

Ms. Howard departed the meeting during Executive Session at approximately 10:00 a.m.

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Ms. Heard to RECONVENE into Regular Session.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Excused
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 7-0.

The meeting reconvened at 10:18 a.m.

**Next Meetings**

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meetings will be held on February 16 and March 23, 2021. The meetings will start at 8:30 a.m.

**Adjournment**

MOTION made by Mr. Corrado and SECONDED by Ms. Heard to ADJOURN the meeting.

**Roll call vote was taken:**

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Yes
Ms. Howard -	Excused
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Yes
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

The Motion was APPROVED 7-0.

The meeting ADJOURNED at 10:20 a.m.

**Attest**

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
John Lumpkin, Chair

  
\_\_\_\_\_  
Mary K. Stanforth, Committee Secretary