



**Jointly Held
Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees
Meeting Minutes**

March 15, 2022

Members Present: John A. Lumpkin, Jointly Held Committees Chair
Vince Corrado
Al Fullenkamp
Sharon Hairston
Sharon Howard
Belinda Matthews-Stenson (arrived at 8:40 a.m.)
Thomas Weckesser
David P. Williamson

Excused: Adrienne Heard

Staff in Attendance: Bob Ruzinsky
Roland Caldwell
Chris Conard, Coolidge Wall Co., L.P.A.
Tim Harrington
Deborah Howard
Pat O'Malley
Brandon Policicchio
Mary Kay Stanforth

Mr. Lumpkin called the meeting to order at 8:33 a.m. and roll call was taken:

Roll Call

Mr. Lumpkin -	Yes
Mr. Corrado -	Yes
Mr. Fullenkamp -	Yes
Ms. Hairston -	Yes
Ms. Heard -	Excused
Ms. Howard -	Yes
Ms. Matthews-Stenson -	Not present
Mr. Weckesser -	Yes
Mr. Williamson -	Yes

A quorum was present, and proper notice of the meeting had been given.

Approval of February 15, 2022 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees Meeting Minutes

Mr. Lumpkin asked if attendees request a reading of the minutes or have corrections to the minutes. There were no requests or corrections.

MOTION made by Mr. Fullenkamp and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson to APPROVE the February 15, 2022 Jointly Held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meeting minutes. The Motion was APPROVED 7-0.

April 2022 Board Action Items

Action Item #2 – Janitorial Services

Mr. O’Malley explained that the purpose of this procurement is to obtain the most qualified contractor to handle the janitorial duties at the Wright Stop Plaza and the four (4) Transit Centers. Greater Dayton Regional Transit Authority’s (RTA) responsibility is to maintain a neat, clean and safe environment for all customers, staff, and vendors. The services provided in this contract enables RTA to meet that public responsibility. This project is consistent with RTA’s core values of Safety and Stewardship. During these times of Covid-19, the importance of disinfecting all surfaces and maintaining an orderly, sanitary and secure environment are a top priority.

Proposals were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, the *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Request for Proposals were initially sent to thirty-six (36) firms.

At 2:00 p.m., on February 3, 2022, six (6) proposals were received and reviewed by the evaluation committee.

The Evaluation Committee reviewed the proposals to determine and designate the most qualified proposer using the following criteria:

- Experience
- Action plan
- Cost
- Quality of proposal preparation

The following firms submitted proposals:

	Alpha & Omega Building Services	MJ Building Solutions, LLC	LGC Global Energy FM, LLC	APT Services, LLC	Robinson Support Services	**Exceptional Products and Services, LLC
	Kettering, OH	Dayton, OH	Detroit, MI	Dayton, OH	Trotwood, OH	Dayton, OH
Base Year One	\$383,500	*	*	*	*	*
Base Year Two	383,500	*	*	*	*	*
Base Year Three	391,170	*	*	*	*	*
Base Year Four	391,170	*	*	*	*	*
Base Year Five	398,993	*	*	*	*	*
Op. Year One	406,973	*	*	*	*	*
Op. Year Two	415,113	*	*	*	*	*
Grand Total	\$2,770,419	*	*	*	*	*
Material Mark-Up %	10					

*FTA Procurement guidelines require that only the successful proposer’s pricing data be disclosed publicly.
 **Non-Responsive.

This procurement will be funded from Operating Funds.

MOTION made by Mr. Williamson and SECONDED by Mr. Corrado that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Alpha & Omega Building Services for Janitorial Services for five (5) base years and two (2) Option Years: Year One \$383,500, Year Two \$383,500, Year Three \$391,170, Year Four \$391,170, Year Five \$398,993 for a total of \$1,948,333 and Option Year One at \$406,973, and Option Year Two for \$415,113 totaling \$822,086, plus a 20% contingency of \$554,084 to cover any potential Covid supplies and/or services and price increases to supplies for a grand total of \$3,324,503.

The Motion was APPROVED 7-0-1, with Ms. Matthews-Stenson abstaining.

Action Item #3 – Engine Parts

Mr. O’Malley explained that the purchase of engine parts is a routine procurement. The engine parts are used daily by the Maintenance Department to ensure the proper maintenance of the fleet. As the engines are comprised of hundreds of parts, too numerous to list individually for bid purposes, the bidders are asked to bid a percentage of discount on the part manufacturer’s published price schedules. As the parts manufacturer issues new national price lists, they will supersede the currently used list; however, the same plus (+) or minus (-) factor will apply.

Parts Manufacturers’ price schedules typically contain different columns of pricing. For example, Cummins’ parts list contains the following price columns, in order of least expensive to most expensive: Dealer Cost, Service Associate, Wholesale, Fleet, Repair, and List. For RTA’s purposes, the bidders are required to bid a (+) or (-) factor and state the column to which it applies, for example, -10% List.

Sealed bids for the purchase of engine parts for three (3) years with two (2) one-year options were solicited through the *Dayton Daily News*, *Dayton Weekly News*, and *Transit Talent*. Invitations for Bid were sent to 16 vendors.

At 2:00 p.m. on February 22, 2022, three (3) bids were received and publicly opened. The results were as follows:

Engine Parts
Base Years 1-3 & Option Years 1-2

Firm	Cummins Engine Parts	Cummins Recon Engine Parts
Cummins Inc. dba Cummins Sales and Service Cincinnati, OH	-7% Service Associate	-7% Service Associate
Palmer Trucks Kenworth of Dayton Dayton, OH	Wholesale +7%	Wholesale +7%
Rush Truck Centers of Ohio* dba Rush Truck Center, Dayton Dayton, OH	Cost + 5%	Cost + 5%

*Nonresponsive

A price analysis was done, and Cummins' -7% Service Associate bid proved to be the lowest. Included in the board packet was a Price Comparison sheet.

Funds for engine parts are included in the Maintenance operating budget.

MOTION made by Ms. Hairston and SECONDED by Mr. Williamson that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD to Cummins Inc. dba Cummins Sales and Service for Engine Parts in the following estimated amounts:

Base Year	Cummins New Engine Parts	Cummins Recon Engine Parts
Year 1	\$132,600	\$121,000
Year 2	\$145,900	\$133,100
Year 3	\$160,500	\$146,400
Base Years 1 – 3 Est. Total	\$439,000	\$400,500
Option Year 1	\$176,600	\$161,000
Option Year 2	\$194,300	\$177,000
Option Years 1 – 2 Est. Total	\$370,900	\$338,000
Total Base & Option Years	\$809,900	\$738,500
Grand Total Not to Exceed Amount	\$1,548,400	

Actual expenditures will vary based on usage.

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

Action Item #4 – Office 365

Mr. Harrington explained that the purpose of this procurement is to contract with a vendor for an Office 365 Enterprise Licensing Agreement for Office 365 for Greater Dayton RTA.

RTA is looking to move to Microsoft Office 365 for our office productivity suite. Microsoft Office 2013, with Exchange 2016 (on-premises) is currently being run. Microsoft has designated these platforms as end-of-life; therefore, they need to be upgraded. Moving to Office 365 makes sense for RTA, as it is cloud-based and will keep us on the most modern version of Microsoft Office. Moving to Office 365 will also provide RTA with the needed tools, instead of requiring that it be piecemealed together with other expensive solutions.

Office 365 includes components such as Teams, OneDrive, SharePoint Online, Planner, Forms, Tasks, Lists, and more. Office 365 also includes the Power Platform, which allows users to build solutions to common issues and includes Business Intelligence, Process Automation, Virtual Agents (bots), and Custom Apps for engaging with customers and employees.

Office 365 Enterprise Software Licensing was solicited through US General Services Administration (GSA Advantage) from four (4) contractors. Pricing obtained is for a three (3) year licensing agreement.

The results are as follows:

Company	GovConnect* Wilmington, OH	Insight Dayton, OH	Miniburn Great Falls, VA	SHI Enterprise Dublin, OH
Year 1	\$54,728	\$55,638	\$56,055	\$57,827
Year 2	\$54,728	\$55,638	\$56,055	\$57,827
Year 3	\$54,728	\$55,638	\$56,055	\$57,827
Total	\$164,184	\$166,914	\$168,165	\$173,481

*Non-responsive

To complete this project the following essential parts of Office 365 are needed: Integration & Data Migration Services at an estimated \$56,000, Unitrends Spanning Backup Licensing Agreement at \$23,000, and Employee Training at an estimated \$14,000 and will be awarded to other vendors under small purchasing procedures.

Office 365 is funded out of the Operating Budget.

MOTION made by Mr. Fullenkamp and SECONDED by Mr. Weckesser that the Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees RECOMMEND to the Board of Trustees a contract AWARD for the purchase of a three (3) year Office 365 Enterprise Licensing Agreement to Insight in the amount of \$166,914.

The Motion was APPROVED 8-0.

Customer and Business Development Update

Mr. Policicchio stated the Customer and Business Development Department update was provided in today’s meeting packet. Mr. Policicchio stated his team will be launching in the coming month, a new program related to service guarantees. When service does not operate and a customer contacts RTA, credits may be applied to registered Tapp Pay customer accounts in order to make things right with customers. Mr. Policicchio also shared upcoming information on public hearings that will present proposals for fare and service changes.

Financial Report

Ms. Stanforth provided information regarding the February 2022 financial report.

- Passenger fares are down \$289,000 Year-to-Date (YTD) as compared to budget due to Covid and service impacts.
- Sales tax represents the total of January and February budgeted amounts.
- Total revenues are \$2.1 million under budget YTD mostly due to lower assistance from state and federal governments.
- Total expenses are \$3.2 million under budget YTD. Employee wages and fringe benefits, contract services and materials and supplies were the major contributors.
- RTA’s YTD service gain after deducting the local capital charge is \$553,000.

Small Purchasing Information

Ms. Stanforth stated the Small Purchasing Information was included in today’s meeting packet. There were no questions regarding small purchases.

Next Meetings

The upcoming jointly held Finance/Personnel and Planning Committees meetings will be held on April 19 and May 17, 2022. The meetings will start at 8:30 a.m.

Adjournment

Mr. Lumpkin ADJOURNED the meeting at 9:11 a.m.

ATTEST


John Lumpkin, Chair


Brandon Policicchio, Committee Secretary